

Bristol Bay Salmon Drift Gillnet Fishery Optimum Number Report

CFEC Report 04-3N
October, 2004

Commercial Fisheries Entry Commission
8800 Glacier Highway #109
Juneau, Alaska 99801

EEOC / ADA Compliance Statement

The Alaska Department of Fish and Game administers all programs and activities free from discrimination based on race, color, national origin, age, sex, religion, marital status, pregnancy, parenthood, or disability. The department administers all programs and activities in compliance with Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, Section 504 of the Rehabilitation Act of 1973, Title II of the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990, the Age Discrimination Act of 1975, and Title IX of the Education Amendments of 1972.

If you believe you have been discriminated against in any program, activity, or facility, or if you desire further information please write to ADFG, P.O. Box 25526, Juneau, AK 99802-5526; U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, 4040 N. Fairfax Drive, Suite 300 Webb, Arlington, VA 22203; or O.E.O., U.S. Department of the Interior, Washington DC 20240.

For information on alternative formats for this and other department publications, please contact the department ADA Coordinator at (voice) 907-465-4120, (TDD) 907-465-3646, or (fax) 907-465-2440

Bristol Bay Salmon Drift Gillnet Fishery Optimum Number Report

Abstract

This report presents the results of a study used to determine the optimum number of permits in the Bristol Bay salmon drift gillnet fishery. Under terms of AS.16.43.290, the Commercial Fisheries Entry Commission is directed to determine optimum numbers of permits for the state's limited entry fisheries. The statutes require the commission to choose an optimum number which represents a reasonable balance of three general standards. The standards include economic, conservation, and fishery management concerns.

The report considers each standard separately. It includes a history of the regulatory development of the fishery, historical harvest data, estimates of historical costs and returns in the fishery, forecasts of future returns in the fishery, and a detailed background discussion of conservation concerns. The report recommends that an optimum number falling in the range of 800 to 1,200 permits would represent a reasonable balance of the three standards.

The commission will consider this report and propose for public review and comment a regulation to establish an optimum number for the Bristol Bay salmon drift gill net fishery.

List of Preparers:

Kurt Schelle
Kurt Iverson
Nancy Free-Sloan
Stefanie Carlson

Table of Contents

Introduction

| | |
|---|---|
| Program Basics..... | 1 |
| Optimum Number Developments since 1973..... | 2 |
| Outline of This Report..... | 6 |

Chapter 1: Optimum Numbers Under Alaska’s Limited Entry Law

| | |
|--|----|
| 1.0 Optimum Numbers Under AS 16.43.290 | 11 |
| 1.1 Previous Understandings of AS 16.43.290..... | 12 |
| 1.2 The Economic Optimum Number of Permits: Previous Work..... | 12 |
| 1.3 The Management Optimum Number of Entry Permits: Previous Work..... | 18 |
| 1.4 The Third Optimum Number Criterion: Previous Work..... | 19 |
| 1.5 Summary | 20 |

Chapter 2: History and Management of the Fishery

| | |
|--|----|
| 2.0 Introduction | 23 |
| 2.1 Overview of the Bristol Bay Area | 23 |
| 2.2 Sockeye Salmon Biology | 24 |
| 2.3 Historical Harvests | 25 |
| 2.4 Historical Development of Management Regulations | 26 |
| 2.5 Limited Entry in Bristol Bay..... | 27 |
| 2.6 Current Management Objectives..... | 29 |
| 2.6.a Escapement Goals and Maximum Sustained Yield..... | 29 |
| 2.6.a.(1) Kvichak River Escapement | 33 |
| 2.6.b Genetic Diversity and Healthy-Fish Escapement..... | 34 |
| 2.6.c Product Quality | 35 |
| 2.6.d Orderly Fisheries..... | 36 |
| 2.7 Inseason Management..... | 36 |
| 2.7.a Escapement Enumeration | 37 |
| 2.7.b Age Class Determination..... | 38 |
| 2.7.c Preseason Forecasts..... | 38 |
| 2.7.d Port Moeller Test Fishing..... | 38 |
| 2.7.e Inseason Run Predictions | 39 |
| 2.7.f District Test Fisheries..... | 39 |
| 2.7.g Inside Test Fisheries..... | 39 |
| 2.7.h Aerial Surveys..... | 40 |
| 2.7.i Fishery Performance | 40 |
| 2.8 Regulations | 40 |
| 2.9 Summary | 43 |

Chapter 3: Estimates of Historic Net Economic Returns

| | | |
|-----|--|----|
| 3.0 | Introduction | 47 |
| 3.1 | Evidence of Permit Values | 47 |
| 3.2 | Estimates of Net Economic Returns | 53 |
| 3.3 | Measures of Net Returns Used in the Study | 54 |
| 3.4 | Returns to Labor, Management, and Investment | 55 |
| 3.5 | Profits | 55 |
| 3.6 | Payments Excluded From Net Return Measures | 57 |
| 3.7 | Nominal Return Estimates, 1983-2003 | 59 |
| 3.8 | Real Return Estimates, 1983-2003 | 64 |
| 3.9 | Summary | 65 |

Chapter 4: Forecasts of Future Economic Net Returns

| | | |
|-------|--|-----|
| 4.0 | Introduction | 73 |
| 4.1 | Description of the Model and Key Assumptions | 75 |
| 4.1.a | Forecasts of Future Harvests | 76 |
| 4.1.b | Forecasts of Future Sockeye Ex-Vessel Prices | 77 |
| 4.1.c | Forecasts of Ex-Vessel Prices for Other Bristol Bay Salmon Species | 82 |
| 4.1.d | Forecasts of Average Gross Earnings per Permit | 88 |
| 4.1.e | Forecasts of Average Total Costs in the Fishery | 88 |
| 4.2 | Forecasts of Future Net Returns | 90 |
| 4.2.a | Baseline Scenario | 91 |
| 4.2.b | High Ex-Vessel Price Scenario | 96 |
| 4.2.c | Low Ex-Vessel Price Scenario | 100 |
| 4.3 | Summary and Recommendation for Economic Optimum Numbers | 104 |

Chapter 5: Management Optimum Number

| | | |
|-------|---|-----|
| 5.0 | Introduction | 109 |
| 5.1 | Definitions Applied to Standard Two | 110 |
| 5.1.a | Sound Fishery Management Techniques | 111 |
| 5.2.a | Orderly and Efficient Harvesting | 113 |
| 5.3.a | Resource Conservation | 115 |
| 5.2 | Conceptual Bounds for Standard Two Used in This Report | 116 |
| 5.2.a | Concept One | 116 |
| 5.2.b | Concept Two | 116 |
| 5.3 | The Department of Fish and Game's Answers to CFEC's Questions | 117 |
| 5.4 | Impacts of the Number of Units of Gear | 117 |
| 5.5 | Estimates of Management Optimum Numbers | 120 |
| 5.6 | Summary | 121 |

Chapter 6: Summary and Recommendations

6.0 Introduction 125
6.1 Review of Optimum Number Standard One..... 125
6.2 Review of Optimum Number Standard Two 129
6.3 Review of Optimum Number Standard Three 132
6.4 Optimum Number Recommendations 133
6.5 Other Considerations 136

Literature Cited 139

Appendix I:

April 16, 2003 CFEC Memo to ADFG Commissioner Kevin Duffy 141

Appendix II:

July 9, 2003 Memo From ADFG Commissioner Kevin Duffy to CFEC 153

List of Tables

| | | |
|---------------|--|----|
| Table 2.1 | 2004 Sockeye Escapement Goals (in 1,000's of fish) | 32 |
| Table 2.2 | 2004 Chinook, Chum, Coho, and Pink Salmon Escapement Goals..... | 32 |
| Table 2.3 | Summary of Bristol Bay Salmon Mangement Plans..... | 41 |
| Table 3.1.a | Bristol Bay Salmon Drift Gillnet Fishery, 1975-2003: Permits Fished, Average Pounds, Average Sockeye Price, Average Gross Earnings, and Average Permit Value (in nominal dollars for each year) | 49 |
| Table 3.1.b | Bristol Bay Salmon Drift Gillnet Fishery, 1975-2003: Permits Fished, Average Pounds, Average Sockeye Price, Average Gross Earnings, and Average Permit Value (dollars are constant-value, “real 2003” dollars for each year)..... | 52 |
| Table 3.2 | Definitions of Net Return Measures | 58 |
| Table 3.2.a | Bristol Bay Salmon Drift Gillnet Fishery, 1983-2003: Estimated (nominal \$) Average Gross Earnings, Costs, and Net Returns..... | 61 |
| Table 3.2.b | Bristol Bay Salmon Drift Gillnet Fishery, 1983-2003: “Real 2003 \$\$” Estimated Average Gross Earnings, Costs, and Net Returns..... | 66 |
| Table 4.1. | Estimated Average Ex-vessel Prices for Bristol Bay Salmon, Prices are in Nominal and Real Dollars per Pound | 84 |
| Table 4.2. | Estimated Average Bristol Bay Sockeye Salmon Ex-Vessel Prices by Decade..... | 90 |
| Table 4.2.a-1 | Baseline Scenario: Ex-Vessel Prices by Salmon Species. Mean Prices From the Distribution of Sample Means of 100 Simulations..... | 92 |
| Table 4.2.a-2 | Baseline Scenario: Frequency Distribution of Sockeye Ex-Vessel Prices From 100 Simulations of 25 Years, Measured in Real 2003 Dollars per Pound..... | 93 |
| Table 4.2.a-3 | Baseline Scenario: Average Pounds per Permit, Average Gross Earnings, Average Costs, and Average Economic Profits, by Number of Permits. Distribution of Means From 100 Simulations of 25 Years into the Future..... | 95 |

| | | |
|---------------|--|-----|
| Table 4.2.b-1 | High Price Scenario: Ex-Vessel Prices by Salmon Species. Mean Prices From the Distribution of Sample Means of 100 Simulations..... | 96 |
| Table 4.2.b-2 | High Price Scenario: Frequency Distribution of Sockeye Ex-Vessel Prices From 100 Simulations of 25 Years, Measured in Real 2003 Dollars per Pound..... | 97 |
| Table 4.2.b-3 | High Price Scenario: Average Pounds per Permit, Average Gross Earnings, Average Costs, and Average Economic Profits, by Number of Permits. Distribution of Means From 100 Simulations of 25 Years Into the Future..... | 99 |
| Table 4.2.c-1 | Low Price Scenario: Ex-Vessel Prices by Salmon Species. Mean Prices From the Distribution of Sample Means of 100 Simulations..... | 100 |
| Table 4.2.c-2 | Low Price Scenario: Frequency Distribution of Sockeye Ex-Vessel Prices From 100 Simulations of 25 Years, Measured in Real 2003 Dollars per Pound | 101 |
| Table 4.2.c-3 | Low Price Scenario: Average Pounds per Permit, Average Gross Earnings, Average Costs, and Average Economic Profits, by Number of Permits. Distribution of Means From 100 Simulations of 25 Years into the Future..... | 103 |

List of Figures

| | | |
|-------------|--|----|
| Figure 2.1 | Bristol Bay Commercial Salmon Fishery Districts. | 24 |
| Figure 2.2 | Bristol Bay Salmon Harvests..... | 26 |
| Chart 3.1.a | Bristol Bay Salmon Drift Gill Net Fishery, 1975-2003: Average Gross Earnings per Permit, Average Permit Value, and Average lbs. per Permit (\$ estimates are in nominal dollars)..... | 50 |
| Chart 3.1.b | Bristol Bay Salmon Drift Gill Net Fishery, 1975-2003: Average Gross Earnings per Permit, Average Permit Value, and Average Pounds per Permit \$ Estimates in Real 2003 (constant-value) Dollars..... | 53 |
| Chart 3.2.a | Bristol Bay Salmon Drift Gill Net Fishery, 1983-2003: Average Gross Earnings per Permit, Average Net Returns per Permit, and Permit Values \$ Estimates in Nominal Dollars..... | 64 |

| | | |
|-------------|--|----|
| Chart 3.2.b | Bristol Bay Salmon Drift Gill Net Fishery, 1983-2003: Average Gross Earnings per Permit, Average Net Returns per Permit, and Permit Values \$ Estimates in Real 2003 (constant-value) Dollars..... | 69 |
| Chart 3.3 | Bristol Bay Sockeye Salmon Ex-Vessel Price per Pound, 1975-1983: Real 2003 Dollars and Nominal Dollars..... | 69 |